IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA

CHARLESTON DIVISION

IN RE: ETHICON, INC.,

PELVIC REPAIR SYSTEM

PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

MDL No. 2327

THIS DOCUMENT RELATES TO CIVIL ACTION NO.:

Murrillo, et al. v. Johnson & Johnson, et al.

2:16-cv-3847

PRETRIAL ORDER # 231
(Initial Order Regarding Severance of Actions)

The complaint filed in the above-referenced action joined multiple plaintiffs whose only apparent connection with one another is that they allege they were injured by a pelvic mesh product manufactured by defendants. I **FIND** that multiple plaintiff complaints, except those complaints in which only one individual alleges using a product manufactured by defendants but another derivative plaintiff is named as well (e.g. cases in which a spouse is asserting only a loss of consortium claim), should be severed. Accordingly, to resolve any misjoinder concerns and to facilitate the efficient administration of these actions, it is **ORDERED** as follows:

1. Except for the first named plaintiff (and derivative plaintiff(s) claiming under her, if any) listed in Exhibit A, attached hereto, **and** any plaintiff(s) who objects to severance (see paragraph 7), the remaining plaintiffs in the aforementioned case shall be dismissed without prejudice on or around **May 11, 2016**.

- 2. Within thirty (30) days after the entry of this Pretrial Order ("PTO"), each individual plaintiff dismissed pursuant to paragraph 1 of this PTO who did not object to severance and any derivative plaintiff claiming under her, may file an individual severed complaint to continue the prosecution of the claims they alleged in the dismissed civil action. Each such plaintiff may choose to file in this court, a Short Form Complaint in the form available on the court's website. Each plaintiff is reminded of her obligation to comply with Rule 4 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure.
- 3. Any Short Form Complaint filed by a severed plaintiff must be accompanied by the appropriate filing fee, and assigned a separate civil action number determined by the Clerk.
- 4. Any severed plaintiff who wishes to name as defendants parties who are not listed in the current Master Long Form Complaint as defendants must file an individual complaint in the District Court where such action properly can be filed and await transfer by the Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation (the "Panel").
- 5. Any re-filed action (whether filed in another district or in the Southern District of West Virginia) shall refer to the dismissed civil action number. This information must be added to the Short Form Complaint immediately under the Civil Action Number or to the style of the long form complaint immediately under the Civil Action Number assigned by the Clerk in the district where the action is filed. (*See* Exhibit B, attached hereto.)
- 6. Any individual Complaint filed within the time provided by this PTO will be deemed to have been filed on and relate back to the original filing date of the applicable multi-plaintiff civil action. Any statute of limitations defense that existed as of the filing dates of the original multi-plaintiff complaints shall be preserved.

7. Any plaintiff(s) who objects to this PTO must do so within ten (10) days of entry of this

PTO or by May 6, 2016. Such plaintiff should file her objections in the Southern District of West

Virginia in the original multi-plaintiff case, with any objection not to exceed two (2) pages. Any

plaintiff(s) who objects shall not be severed until such objection is resolved by the court.

8. The court **DIRECTS** the Clerk to place a copy of this PTO in each re-filed action

filed pursuant to this PTO that is directly filed in the Southern District and in each re-filed

action filed pursuant to this PTO that is transferred by the Panel on the date the case is opened

in the Southern District.

The court DIRECTS the Clerk to file a copy of this order in 2:12-md-02327 and in

member case 2:16-cv-3847 and it shall apply to each member related case previously transferred

to, removed to, or filed in this district, which includes counsel in all member cases up to and

including civil action number 2:16-cv-3902. In cases subsequently filed in this district, a copy of

the most recent pretrial order will be provided by the Clerk to counsel appearing in each new action

at the time of filing of the complaint. In cases subsequently removed or transferred to this court, a

copy of the most recent pretrial order will be provided by the clerk to counsel appearing in each

new action upon removal or transfer. It shall be the responsibility of the parties to review and abide

by all pretrial orders previously entered by the court. The orders may be accessed through the

CM/ECF system or the court's website at www.wvsd.uscourts.gov.

ENTER: April 26, 2016

JOSEPH R. GOODWIN

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

3

MDL 2327 - EXHIBIT A

Plaintiffs	Originating District	Originating Case No.	SDWV – MDL Member Case No.
Tianuns	District	Case 110.	Wiember Case No.
	Texas Northern	3:16-cv-955	2:16-cv-3847
Martha Murillo			
Kathleen Bates			
Jamie Anzaldua			
Michelle Jackson			
Odis Payne			
Donna Neill			
Cheryl Biederstadt			
Monica Lorenz			
Bonnie Konrad Linda Bandy			
Debra Manderfield			
Gale Mitchell			
Angela Reed-Smartt			
Lorraine Spivey			
Christine Belcher			
Janet Stagray			
Gertrude Escalona Justo			
Carla Anne Owen			
Linda Brooks			
Tammy Hawkes			
Hilda Crabtree			
Teresa Smith			
Linda Butler			
Ginger Ostendorf			
Cathy Choate Linda Tursic			
Jane Robinson			
Veronica Kelly			
Carolyn Lilly			
Melody VanDenBeldt			
Deborah Kleek			
Eva Corcoran			
Margaret Colbert			
Rhoda Elliott			
Sylvia Quintana			
Gloria Morsell			
Edwina Rose			
Terri Ballard			
Carolyn Wall			
Sheri Izworski			
Barbour Cris Sprouse			
George Izworski			
Anna Hanbury			

Plaintiffs	Originating District	Originating Case No.	SDWV – MDL Member Case No.
1 families	District	Case No.	Wiember Case No.
	Texas Northern	3:16-cv-955	2:16-cv-3847
David Hanbury	Texas i voi mem	3.10 CV 733	2.10 07 3017
Rebecca Shaw			
Eugenia Bender			
Larry Bender			
Glendia Ezell			
Shontelle Smith			
Hazel King Faust			
Madeline Taylor			
Peggy Young			
Helen Hunt			
Cynthia Rawlings			
Leta Wilson			
Denise Fontaine			
Brooke Woodman			
Constance Chapman			
LaDonna Terrell			
Stephanie Whittington			
Sandra Neace			
Denise Balko			
Mary Armour			
Teonia Atkinson			
Denis Davis			
Brenda Herndon			
Kimberly Magruder			
Kim Price			
Marlynn Rodriguez			
Dawn Schrock			
Shirley Scieszka			
Renea Semeneck			
Brandy Shafer			
Leona Mahoney			
Peggy Palomarez			
Victoria Kingston			
Mary Webster			
Hope Tippens			
Pauline Hunter			
Deborah Omellette			
Darlene Morgan			
Sharolynn Crutchfield			
Mary Toler			
Donnis Townsend			
Beckie Rader			
Rhonda Moore Barbara Fishburn			
Cynthia Brewer			

Plaintiffs	Originating District	Originating Case No.	SDWV – MDL Member Case No.
Tianithis	District	Case No.	Wiember Case No.
	Texas Northern	3:16-cv-955	2:16-cv-3847
Annmarie Allie	Texas i voi mem	3.10 67 733	2.10 CV 3017
Daisy Tolen			
Wanda Williams			
Billie Christopher			
Judith Pojda			
Edith Kruh			
Betty Dye			
Elaine Jacoby			
Kennetha Curtis			
Holli Madsen			
Donna Clifford			
Diane Thompson			
Madeline Allen			
Linda Belile			
Jessica McBath			
Peggy Hallman			
Susan Adams			
Joyce Kurtz			
Robin Bowen			
Sheila Calvert			
Elaine Wood			
Carney West			
Linda Campbell			
Paula Robinson			
Leticia Santiago			
Jane Harvey			
Betty Gouge			
Becky Gonder			
Dawnette Franco-Wright			
Charlotte Pemelton			
Laura Heckman			
Alanna Manning			
Judith Clarke			
Shirley Fischer			
Angela Mausert			
Tally Chang			
Connie Napier			
Terri Luther			
Kathy Hickey			
Mary Canter			
Kathy Hughes			
Ruth Diefenderfer			
Madalena Lovato			
Cheryl Cole			
June Bowen			

Plaintiffs	Originating District	Originating Case No.	SDWV – MDL Member Case No.
1 lamums	District	Case No.	Member Case No.
	Texas Northern	3:16-cv-955	2:16-cv-3847
Lorie Wilsey	Texas i voi mem	3.10 CV 755	2.10 CV 3017
Betty Colburn			
Jennifer Warren			
Genevieve Moreno			
Kathy Simpson			
Valerie Weston			
Mary Krall			
Shawanda Gallow			
Karen Shepard			
Elizabeth Klein			
Marion Copeland			
Patty Ackman			
Yvonne Helton			
Kelly Pennacchini			
Carol Tigar			
Teresa Hartman			
Karen Marques			
Glenna Black			
Shelby Bankston			
Cynthia Starnes			
Gail Zann			
Brenda Winter			
Dorothy Avery			
Earnestine Scriven			
Carolyn Davis			
Roberta Cordova			
Catherine Scandlon			
Nancy Massie			
Joan Shepherd			
Sarah Lugo			
Mary Lou Dehart			
Effie Crowder			
Margaret Lafollette			
Shenelle Perry			
Bernice Mack			
Sharon Ingram			
Mary Helen Barrera			
Elizabeth Thompson			
Dana Rocha			
Ghedra Dunn			
Theresa Dallas			
Antoinette Lepore			
Marcia Williams			
Susan Lowry			
Jill Beaver			

Plaintiffs	Originating District	Originating Case No.	SDWV – MDL Member Case No.
Flamuns	District	Case No.	Member Case No.
	Towns North or	2.16 or 055	2.16 2.2047
Chinley Canables	Texas Northern	3:16-cv-955	2:16-cv-3847
Shirley Spuehler			
Marcia Derosier			
Tammy Platzek			
Jodine Betrozoff-Rubey			
Maria Agosto			
Deloris Kennedy			
Elaine Whitaker			
Melonie Shultz			
Leticia Villa			
Sharon Sowers			
Debra Bustillo			
Leona Martin			
Pamela Boles			
Laura Burks			
Rochelle Cobenais			
Nancy Weckman			
Gerri Moore			
Charla English			
Elsie Arb			
Helene Lebied			
Kimberly Archuleta			
Laura Rodriguez			
Mary Greco			
Theresa Galano-Burkett			
Brenda Pye			
Norma Setum			

Exhibit B

I. For Directly Filed Cases:

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF WEST VIRGINIA

CHARLESTON DIVISION

In Re: Ethicon Inc., Pelvic Repair System Products Liability Litigation MDL No. 2327

Civil Action No.	
(Severed from Civil Action No)	

SHORT FORM COMPLAINT

II. For All Other Cases:

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF LOUSIANA

TABATHA ARNOLD, et al.	
Plaintiffs,	
v.	Civil Action No(Severed from SDWV Civil Action No)
JOHNSON & JOHNSON, et al.,	
Defendants.	
COMPLAIN	Γ AND JURY DEMAND